

## **Open Work Session**

### **Wicomico County Economic Impact Scholarship Program – Grade Point Average**

**December 5, 2017**

Dr. Murray Hoy, President of Wor-Wic Community College, came before Council. Mr. Cannon said Council had originally put this on as a Resolution. He said Council had some discussions with some community groups, to include Mr. Mike Dunn, and a few others, who said they would like to at least see it in a Work Session, and he knows Dr. Hoy is in favor of that as well. He said that is the purpose of this Work Session.

Dr. Hoy said he hopes he is able to respond to Council's questions, and he appreciates Mr. Kilmer's comment earlier about wanting to improve the program. He said he thinks there are ways to improve the program, but he does not believe raising the GPA to 2.5 is a way to do that. He said, going back to the purpose of the program, it is to increase the percentage of population with a college degree, and reduce the brain drain in their community, in order to provide a much more educated workforce for the County's businesses, and also to encourage new businesses to consider coming to Wicomico County, because they will acknowledge that the County has a skilled workforce, and that there are people here who can help them in their individual businesses. He said these individuals will have an opportunity to get an education, stay here in this community, buy homes, buy cars, and help the community grow stronger, expanding the tax base, and that is what it is all about. He said, historically, over 90 percent of their students stay in the community, even after transferring and earning advanced degrees. He said he represents that, as he is a Maryland Community College graduate who went to Chesapeake College. He said Wor-Wic did not exist, and he was from the Upper Shore. He said he has never left the Shore, but he stayed on the Upper Shore for 26 years after he completed his studies at Chesapeake, much like their community college students do. He said, yes, he did move, but he did not move far, and he left two additional generations behind in Kent County, who are continuing to keep that economy going, so at least he was able to do something in that regard. He said he is very representative of the types of students who start, and then continue staying in their communities after they graduate from college. He said, in spite of being home to two excellent higher education institutions, Wor-Wic and Salisbury University, and neighbor to a third, Wicomico County lags behind the State in the percentage of population with a college degree. He said the County currently has about 35 percent of a working age population with a college degree, compared to 49 percent in the State of Maryland. He said Maryland is trying to achieve 55 percent, so they have to continue to improve the County in order to be competitive in the State of Maryland, and certainly competitive regionally. He said, for some of those reasons, he thinks this increase to a 2.5 GPA for incoming students is a mistake. He said they are not going to solve the workforce needs by creaming, and what he means by saying that is, taking only the top students. He said they need to be able to offer opportunities to as many students as possible, including those who were otherwise unlikely to attend college. He said, frankly, that is where they are going to get the growth for those people who are unlikely to attend college, and that is many of the students they are talking about here. He said Council heard Mr. Neat say that studies show that most jobs with family-sustaining incomes require at least some college, and those are growing by number, and that 25 percent delta between a high school graduate and a community college Associate Degree graduate is significant over the period of a lifetime. He said one of the underlying purposes is to have more students access education, and excluding 37 percent of the County high school graduates is not going to do that. He said what he means by that is, of the 2017 high school graduating class of Wicomico County, 342, or 37 percent, had less than a 2.5 grade point average. He said the average of the entire class was 2.7. He said it takes a 2.0 grade point average, as Mr. Rudnick mentioned, to graduate from college. He said they

have quite a few very significant, successful workers who have a 2.0 grade point average, and Mr. Rudnick is a perfect example of that. Dr. Hoy said he has had the opportunity to work with Mr. Rudnick for about 16 years, and he did a tremendous job for their institution. He said he agrees with Council that raising the eligibility criteria can improve the success rate, just like hospitals can improve their outcomes by only admitting healthy patients, but that does not make any sense either. He repeated, hospitals can improve their outcomes if they only admit healthy patients, and he asked if Council agrees, to which Mr. Cannon responded, no, he does not agree with Dr. Hoy's analogy. Dr. Hoy said he understands Mr. Cannon does not agree, but what he is saying is that Harvard, Yale, Stanford, and those institutions that are bringing in 4.0 students are going to have better outcomes, there is no question about that. Mr. Cannon said those students will be better prepared, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they are going to have better outcomes because they are coming in better prepared, there is no question about it. He asked, when 37 percent of the students who graduate from the local schools in this County have less than a 2.5 grade point average, are they just going to be thrown away? He said that is just not helpful, that is not good, and, again, they are trying to increase the percentage of population with a college degree, and that is not done with the people who were already going to go to college. He said there are a lot of late bloomers who are not really successful in high school, or they do not meet Council's definition of success, but, once given an opportunity, they can thrive in a college setting. He said a year does not go by at graduation where a student does not come up to him and say, "Dr. Hoy, you are not going to believe this. I graduated with a 4.0 average," or, "I'm an honors graduate here, but when I was in high school, I barely made it through. I was the worst student in school." Dr. Hoy said there could not have been that many students who were the worst student in each school, but he hears it every year, year in and year out. He said they are able to succeed because some people do not play the high school game well, they had not figured it out, but once they get to college, they do figure it out, and they become successful. He said that is important, and they have to have opportunities for these students. He said he knows some of Council has been harping on the statistics from the first class, and that is the class that was thrown together in less than a month last year. He said this program was not even approved until after the 2017 students graduated and left high school. He said this program was not on the radar of the students who came into the program, but they came forward and participated in this program, and he knows there is a lot of focus on this. He said, of the students who are no longer receiving the County's scholarship, some are still enrolled as students on a part-time basis, and others have transferred on to another institution. He said that is not a bad outcome, because they typically come back, and even those who do not end up graduating come back and live in this community. He said, as far as those who are going part-time, one of the reasons they are going part-time is they had to work. He said they have had students turn down the opportunity to be in the program because they had to work full-time, and they recognize they are not going to be successful if they work full-time while trying to go to school full-time. He said, for those people who say these kids do not have skin in the game, he thinks that is wrong. He said these students have to give up an income, give up a job, to attend school full-time, as the scholarship does not pay their bills. He said it covers tuition and fees, but, in the case of community college students and the tuition rates, sometimes books are every bit as expensive as tuition. He said there are lots of costs associated with this. He said he thinks the assertion that the program was not successful after this first year class is something that disheartens him the most, because, he can say with a very high degree of certainty, the experience of one cohort does not constitute a trend. He said Council has jumped to the conclusion that they did not like what they saw out of a small cohort of students, and that is the reason to make this significant change actually increasing the GPA. He said in this past year's class, they had eighteen students, and ten of them would not meet that criteria. He said Council would be limiting it to eight students who would be eligible under this criteria. He said Council might say they are not trying to do away with the program, but, frankly, it seems to him to be death by a thousand cuts when they do things like that. He said he wants to share an interesting comparison

between the Wicomico program and the Somerset Economic Impact Scholarship Program that the Governor funded. He said the Somerset program does not have an income threshold, much like Garrett's program, and Delaware's program, where there is no income threshold for access into the program. He said even though it is the most economically disadvantaged County in the State of Maryland, half of the Somerset Economic Impact Scholarship students are outside of eligibility for Pell, compared with only 15.5 percent of Wicomico's student cohorts. He repeated, half of them are outside the eligibility. He said he knows some of Council will say that is good, and why should government pay for those people if they can afford it, but who is saying they can afford it? He said the average student loan debt of a baccalaureate level graduate of the 2016 class was \$36,000. He said, with \$36,000 in student debt for baccalaureate degree earners, they are not going to go into the workforce and start buying cars and homes, and have a lot of discretionary income, but they are paying off those loans. He said that is a lot of debt to have, and it is with them for a long time. He said the best thing the County can do is try to reduce that debt, so these graduates can become good consumers in the community, and be trained and educated as part of a stronger workforce. He said the big difference between the Somerset students and the Wicomico students is no family income limit. He said the \$75,000 adjusted gross family income limitation that Council imposed creates a situation where very few Wicomico students can qualify today. He said, remember, it is last dollar funding. He said the way Pell works, the Federal Financial Aid Program, an average family income of \$65,000 or less qualifies for Pell, and mostly full Pell. He said they then have a band of students between \$65,000 and \$75,000, and some of them get partial Pell. He said the County really did not have to pay for that many students, and, in fact, the first year cost the County \$39,000. He said Council appropriated \$262,000 originally, pulled \$50,000 back, so they appropriated for the first year class \$212,000, and only spent \$39,000. He said this is not about money, clearly, if they are talking about \$39,000. He said there are other opportunities, and what Council needs to think of, frankly, if they want to make a change that is going to be more productive and more helpful to the County and students, is to raise the income limitation from the \$75,000 that it is today, to the \$110,000 that they had agreement on, or \$125,000 that was proposed and makes more sense and is where most programs are. He said, to him, he thinks the most important thing they can do is raise the income cap to help more middle-class families be able to afford higher education, and fulfill the intent of the program.

Mr. Dodd said he was trying to remember the numbers Dr. Hoy was throwing out. He asked if it was 37 percent of high school graduates in Wicomico County who had less than a 2.5 grade point average, to which Dr. Hoy responded, yes, and the student average was 2.7. Mr. Dodd then asked, if these high schools have guidance counselors, how did this 37 percent of students slip through the cracks, to which Dr. Hoy asked for clarification on the question. Mr. Dodd said, if the guidance counselors do not guide the students into a pathway for college, he just does not understand. He said there are guidance counselors there, each student sees them, and they discuss college. Dr. Hoy responded, he does not work in the public school system, and he does not know the answer to that question. He said he does know, however, that by having an opportunity like this, Wor-Wic was able to market to people the opportunity for free community college tuition, and people found out they were eligible for free tuition through Pell who would not have even attempted college until they found that out. He said they came through with the intent of participating in this program, they found out it is not going to cost the County a penny, and they can go to school for free, and that is a great opportunity for them as well. He said, in school systems, there are a lot of students, and there are a lot of different opportunities for them. He said some of them are coming to school, and some of them are not, but this reaches out and helps more people come here and stay here. He said that is the intent, to come here and stay here, to which Mr. Dodd responded, he understands that. He said he is just wondering what happened with that 37 percent of students. Dr. Hoy clarified, he is not saying they did not go anywhere, he is saying they had less than a

2.5, so they would be ineligible under this criteria that is being proposed, and they would be ineligible for this program. Mr. Dodd asked Dr. Hoy if Wor-Wic has any scholarships now that have a higher GPA requirement, to which Dr. Hoy responded, sure. He said there are academic scholarships that have higher GPA requirements, and there are financial aid opportunities for low income individuals that give them opportunities to attend college as well. He said, but, everybody is not eligible, and there is not enough money for everybody. Mr. Dodd said he understands.

Mr. Hall said, first of all, he is not an expert in education, and, if he was, he would be sitting where Dr. Hoy is. Mr. Hall said he appreciates Dr. Hoy's dedication and service he has given to this County, and he really does not have an ore in the water here. He said all Dr. Hoy is trying to do is raise the level of the quality of life in Wicomico County, and he cannot see where there is any other benefit for Dr. Hoy, or for Wicomico County, with this service he proposes in this program for Wicomico County. He said he does not think there is any question that, by using this program like it is, the County will increase workforce training, will offer more jobs, and will raise the level of income in Wicomico County, and it does not really matter what the percentage of success rate is. He said, if they have one student who continues, that one person is going to continue to raise the level of success in Wicomico County. He further said, right now they have almost a 30 percent success rate with a program that has just started, and he thinks that is incredible. He said the other thing is, even though two-thirds of the students will not progress, and Dr. Hoy said they may take individual courses or night courses, when they fill out a resume, they do not ever have to say again that their highest level of education is the 12<sup>th</sup> grade. He said they have some college at that point, whether they complete it or not, and that impresses an employer to a certain extent, he thinks, when moving on. He said, again, it is going to raise the level of all the boats that are in water, and he thanks Dr. Hoy, to which Dr. Hoy responded, studies have shown that students with some college make more money than high school graduates. He said, but, he would like to get away from the concept of these students being unsuccessful. He said, frankly, some of his heroes are students who take ten years to graduate, because, they are successful because they are persistent, they continue going to school, they get that degree, and are making a tremendous contribution to their business by being a better educated and better qualified employee. Mr. Hall said one of his local heroes was Doran Christensen, who was the head of the Education Department at Salisbury University. Mr. Hall said Doran told him one time, give him a C student, because they have to work harder for what they get, and they will end up being more successful than an A/B student who does not have to work as hard. Mr. Hall said he has always remembered that. He said here is what they are talking about with education, and giving an opportunity to people who can raise the level all the way around. Dr. Hoy said he talks to incoming students every year, and one of the messages he gives to them is, it does not matter whether they were valedictorian, salutatorian, or the bottom of their class, because whatever they did in the past is not going to be necessarily indicative of what they do in the future. He said they come to Wor-Wic with a clean slate, and they can make whatever they want of themselves, and move forward from that point. He said the valedictorian and salutatorian are going to have to prove it again, and they probably will, but he is very proud of the student who ended up last in the class and becomes an honors graduate. He said, again, it is making sure they give people the opportunity, and provide that opportunity for the citizens so the County can increase the percent of population with a college degree, increase the taxable base, and help their businesses be more successful and more competitive.

Mr. Kilmer said he will echo what Mr. Hall said, and he does think Dr. Hoy does a good job at Wor-Wic. He said he knows they have had many discussions about this and other issues, and this is not personal, so he appreciates all Dr. Hoy has done for Wor-Wic. He continued, with that being said, when they talk about success in this program, the criteria for success is laid out by the program. He said Dr. Hoy is right that, just because people are going to school part-time, or people have other issues and have to work,

does not mean they are not successful. He said success, though, in this discussion, is the criteria for the program, which is 12 credit hours per semester and a 2.0 GPA. He said if people are not meeting that by this program's criteria, he thinks it is fair to say they are not successful by this program's criteria. He said it does not mean they are not successful in Wor-Wic, or in life, or in anything, but for this program. He said he thinks what they need to focus on is how well this program is working as laid out, and how well does the program's criteria lead to further success down the road, in terms of life, school, and things like that. Mr. Kilmer said he and Dr. Hoy had discussions last year privately, and he thinks here as well, about his concern that this program does not necessarily address the barriers to success, broadly defined, that confront many Wor-Wic students, and they can probably talk about that later, but he will just stick on this 2.5 issue. Mr. Kilmer said, for him, it seems that with this program using taxpayers' dollars, Council has to look out for that too, whether it is \$40,000 or \$250,000. He said it seems like the program should be aimed at those students who (1) need it, and (2) will benefit from it the most, not those who are going to take a semester or two, and then drop out of Wor-Wic, for instance, or who could otherwise pay for Wor-Wic themselves. He said it should be narrowly focused on those who will benefit from it, and those who need it. He asked Dr. Hoy if that is something he would agree with, to which Dr. Hoy responded, in part. Dr. Hoy said he does not agree completely, because, again, they have to look at what the purpose is for the program. He said they want to reduce the brain drain, so they want to encourage people to start with Wor-Wic so they will come back and stay in this community. He said, as he pointed out, they have a very limited band of eligibility today, and Council would be decreasing that band by increasing the GPA to a 2.5. He said the eligible number of students almost goes away. Mr. Kilmer said there are a number of students who would enroll in this program, and not complete Wor-Wic for whatever reason, and it seems clear that there are going to be kids who will do that, to which Dr. Hoy responded, that is going to be true of all of Wor-Wic's programs, whether they have scholarships or not. Mr. Kilmer said he does not deny that, but he is talking about the County paying for this, so Council has a right to say that maybe if they do not pay for some of those people, that would be a savings, because they are not going to have the desired benefit. He said, possibly, 2.5 is proxy for a cutoff for some of those students that would not have succeeded, to which Dr. Hoy responded, possibly, but not necessarily. Mr. Kilmer asked Dr. Hoy what he would recommend as to how they could better focus the program on those who are likely to persist in Wor-Wic and meet the program's criteria of two to three years of 12 credit hours, to which Dr. Hoy responded, he thinks, clearly, the family adjusted gross income should be raised so they have a larger pool of people to take advantage of it, and the pool of people who can reduce the brain drain. He said he also thinks they ought to provide the opportunities for those students who are high school graduates and are coming to college, and give them a chance. He said, if they do not sustain them, the County is not spending a whole lot of money when remembering the fact that, if they are not successful in completing the 12 credits, they do not continue. He said they are not throwing money away. However, for those that earn college credits, those college credits do equate to dollars in the workplace, according to statistics. He said this is outside of his realm, but the statistics say that for people who get some college education, there is a pecuniary benefit to them, and there is a benefit to the businesses who get those people. He said those people who say they cannot meet the criteria of 12 credits a semester because they have to work, but still are going to continue in their education, might have only come to Wor-Wic because of this program, so they are giving them that opportunity as well. Mr. Kilmer said that may all be true, but, again, the program is set up to have people persist through, and that is what it was sold as. Dr. Hoy said they want people to persist, there is no question about it. Dr. Hoy said, however, again, to gage things on the first year's class experience really seems ridiculous, in his mind, in the sense that they had 30 days, had already graduated high school, and the counselors had no opportunity to work with any students going into this. He said they found a group of students who came into the program in the first year, and, as he said, one year is not a trend. Mr. Kilmer said he does not necessarily disagree with Dr. Hoy on that, it is not a trend, they are

the hard numbers. He said, unlike Councilman Hall, he does disagree that they can be happy if even just one passes through, but they have to get more bang for their buck. He said this goes into the wider issue they have talked about before, not just with Wor-Wic, in that there is a persistence problem, for whatever reason, in terms of people who are enrolled in community college. He further said, Dr. Hoy knows better than he, but the numbers he saw showed, of the students who enrolled in Wor-Wic and attempted to complete at least 18 hours within two years of enrollment, 63 percent of students did that, and of those 63 percent, the ones who really struggled to persist and have success in the program were those not deemed college-ready. He asked how does one define college-ready, to which Dr. Hoy responded, there is an assessment for college readiness, and, frankly, almost 80 percent of the students who come into Wor-Wic are not college-ready. He said that is what they are starting with, and that is their foundation. Mr. Kilmer said he thinks that is part of the problem with people coming into this program, and he thinks that is probably why some people did not persist. He asked Dr. Hoy if they are working with the Board of Education to make sure people graduating from high schools in Wicomico County are college-ready when they come to college. He clarified, he is not saying Dr. Hoy is doing a bad job, but this is a systemic issue, and if the County is just giving money to these kids who are not coming out of high school college-ready, that is not good use of this taxpayer dollars. He said they need to look at what they can do elsewhere. Dr. Hoy responded, actually, things should be changing in the sense that, in 2013, a Bill was passed in the State of Maryland. He said it was called the College and Career Readiness and College Success Act of 2013 in which they established new criteria for determining whether students were college-ready while they were still in school. He said there is an assessment done in the 11<sup>th</sup> grade, and if they are not college-ready at the end of 11<sup>th</sup> grade, they have to take transition courses in 12<sup>th</sup> grade so they can become college-ready by the time they get to Wor-Wic. He said it should significantly reduce the number of students who need developmental education when coming directly from high school. He said it is not going to help the people who come back, who have been out of education for a while and need a refresher, but it should make a difference for people coming in. He said this year's graduating class was the first class who had a transition course experience, it is going to take several years, and he is not going to base it on one year's experience and say, "Oh gee, it was a failed experiment." He said that was the first class ever who did this, so this will be monitored over a period of time. He said they work very closely with all three public school systems, in terms of helping them, working with them to develop their transition classes. He said they use Wor-Wic's end-of-course assessments for developmental education, because, frankly, the students who complete Wor-Wic's developmental education core are as successful, or even more successful, than the students who did not need it. He said they are using Wor-Wic's end-of-course assessments in the public schools, and they are using their courses in several of the public schools for their transition classes in order to be more successful, so when they come to Wor-Wic, they are ready for college. He said that should make a difference in the long-term. He said they work very closely with the public schools, and he is very pleased with that relationship. He said, in the past, there was not this alignment between high school graduation and college expectation. He said, for example, Algebra II is a requirement, an expectation, for college readiness, but it was not a requirement to complete high school. He said, another thing is, they are now required to take four years of mathematics, taking math every year. He said one of the problems with mathematics is that it is a skill that is lost if not kept up with. He said many of the students were completing their high school math requirements before the 12<sup>th</sup> grade, and, subsequently, they would come to college and be assessed, and found that they had to be remediated somewhat, or they never had Algebra II, and that is not remediation, that is bringing them up to the skill expected. He said there are a lot of changes that have taken place, and he expects to see better outcomes from the public schools, and stronger incoming students in the future. Mr. Kilmer said he is glad to hear this. He said, when they have discussed this before, it caused him to go back and look at what is going on with other promise programs, because they go on around the Country, and there are

legislative proposals in many States. He said, when looking at them, a 2.5 GPA is fairly standard across the Country. He said the idea of a 2.5 GPA did not come from him, by the way, but it came from Mr. Cannon, and this number was not picked up out of thin air. Dr. Hoy then said, but \$75,000 threshold was not found any place either, to which Mr. Kilmer responded, no, he did not find that any place either. Mr. Cannon added, that was not arbitrary. Mr. Kilmer said the one thing that does really stand out is that all of these programs are different, and there is no model for promise programs, to which Dr. Hoy responded, that is because they reflect the values and the needs of the communities. Mr. Kilmer said the Obama Administration, for instance, was really pushing these, and the Obama Whitehouse, in their handbook for these programs they were really pushing, recommends a 2.5 GPA, and recommends some sort of internship requirement. He read "Research shows that scholarships designed to help students with their expenses and encourage good academic progress by requiring them to earn a minimum GPA increases the likelihood of credit accumulation, academic progress, persistence and completion." Dr. Hoy responded, as he has said, he knows their outcomes would improve with a higher GPA, there is no question in his mind. He said he is just telling Mr. Kilmer that it is his opinion they are turning away so many of the high school graduates in Wicomico County, and not providing any other opportunity to help this program grow because of the limitation, that band between \$65,000 and \$75,000, and that does not make a lot of sense. Mr. Kilmer responded, to Dr. Hoy's point, if this were to be imposed, he does not think it would be fair to impose it right away. He said he thinks that part of the reason why a higher GPA requirement works is that it encourages students starting out as a freshman who are told, if they get a 2.5 GPA in four years, they can basically get free college. He said a phased-in program, to him, would be the way to give an incentive to people to improve their academic progress because, if there is a GPA requirement, that is what it should be doing, to incentivize people to have higher GPAs. He said that may be a way to find some common ground, a phased-in 2.5 requirement to give people incentives in high school, and saying this is not going to just be handed to them because they graduated, but it is going to be handed to them because they kept their eye on the ball over these past four years. Dr. Hoy said that makes sense to him because that gives people an opportunity to recognize, if they do this, then they receive that. He said, but, to be honest, if they do this, and their family's income is less than \$75,000, that is different, and he does not know if those students are going to be there or not, or what the situation is going to be. He said that is a limitation that he thinks does not make sense for the program. Mr. Kilmer asked if Dr. Hoy thinks that families who earn under \$125,000 cannot afford Wor-Wic, to which Dr. Hoy responded, he did not say they could not afford it, but they are trying to incentivize people to start here, because, if they do, historically, 90 percent of the students stay in their community. He said, if they start here, they are more than likely to come back. Mr. Kilmer said that the 90 percent figure is a little bit misleading, because it includes all Wor-Wic students, which is also the people who are 40-years-old and going back for classes and have roots here. He asked how many high school graduates who come right out of high school and go to Wor-Wic stay in the community, and he asked if Dr. Hoy has figures for that, to which Dr. Hoy responded, not on the top of his head, but, yes, Wor-Wic has a very high percent of high school graduates who come to their institution, compared to other institutions around the State. He repeated, they have a very competitive high percent of local high school graduates who come to them directly out of high school. Mr. Kilmer said, suppose they say they raise the income level to \$100,000. He said that is 80 percent of Wicomico households. He said right now at \$75,000, that is 67 percent, and that is the vast majority. He said they are not Montgomery County here, but a poor County. Dr. Hoy said he recognizes that as well, and the students are not all going to come to Wor-Wic. Mr. Kilmer said, looking at these other promise programs, they have a variety of different things where they work with the high schools, they work with the students, such as the ASAP Program in New York, which they have discussed before. He asked, if the only improvement Dr. Hoy could see for this program to both target it to those who need it better, and improve persistence in the program, was raising the income level, to which Dr. Hoy responded, there are things

they learned through the first class. He said, realize, again, his staff only had 30 days to rally and get things going. He said they have a couple of grants they are participating in, a Title III grant that 142 first-generation college students are eligible for additional mentoring and tutoring resources, and some cultural experiences, and things that help persistence. He said those students who are participating in that program have a much higher persistence and success rate than those who are not. He said it is kind of like the ASAP Program in the borough of Manhattan, New York. He said it does not have all the features of that program, but it really does make a difference. He said they just got a Veteran's Upper-Bound Trio Program that is going to provide the same services for veterans. He said that is not going to address this group, but it does instill a culture of this sort of help and resource on their campus. He said he does not have the number of staff he would need to provide the additional help to every one of these students. He said they are putting in place a number of things so they can monitor their success, and see what is going on with them. He said they need to improve, there is no question. Mr. Kilmer said, when looking at these other programs, one thing he noticed is there is a real lack of academic study on what makes these programs successful. He asked if that is something they should look at. He said they could have a rigorous university come in and study this program, look at what they are doing, and what would be successful compared to what Kalamazoo does, or what Delaware does. He said there is a real lack of information about what makes these programs work, and what does not make these programs work. He said that makes it difficult when looking at how to fix this program, and they could look at what Kalamazoo does, but does that mean it is more successful than what Wicomico County does. Dr. Hoy said there have been some national studies that have looked at the programs. He said these studies have looked at a number of different things ranging from the number of people who have moved to a community because those programs exist in those communities, and it has increased the population of the community because people realize, if they move here, they have an opportunity for their son or daughter to go to college for free, at least for the first two years. He said people actually move to communities to do that sort of thing. He said there are any number of factors that can be looked at to assess, and when putting this program together, he told Council they would do that, and he welcomes somebody else looking at this. Mr. Kilmer said he is not denigrating what Dr. Hoy has done, but the studies that are really good look at not only what these students are doing, but comparing them to the people who have not been in the program, much more rigorous academic studies about what works and what does not, control groups, and things like that, and that seems like it would be an opportunity here. He said this program is not going away, they are not getting rid of this program, to which Dr. Hoy responded, well they might be if they reduce the number to an unworkable number that does not make any sense. Mr. Kilmer said, to him, it seems they would be interested in finding out what works, and figure out why people have trouble persisting through Wor-Wic, and if they can have this program geared towards fixing some of those problems. He said he does not think they have a good handle on that right now, and he does not think this program really addresses that. He said that has always been his concern with it. He said it is not just people going to Wor-Wic who they should be concerned about, but it is people graduating Wor-Wic, getting what they went into Wor-Wic to get, and coming out of Wor-Wic successful. He said he thinks that if they can design a program that helps boost that, they will have real success. He said he thinks they have an opportunity here to turn this into a program that would do that, and he does not think that just paying free tuition is what will improve that persistence rate and success rate. He said he thinks they should work together to figure out what they can do. Dr. Hoy said he welcomes that.

Mr. Cannon said the one thing he thinks they are losing sight of is the fact they are all on the same team here. He said this was really unprecedented to begin with when it first came to Council, and it was debated quite a bit, and Council voted to approve this program, to which Dr. Hoy responded, he certainly appreciates it, and thinks it was a good move. Mr. Cannon said the idea was that Council did



recognize the fact they needed to try to see some type of economic development, and who better to target than students coming directly out of high school, and Council had very, very high hopes for this, and still does. He said he thinks what Dr. Hoy has to look at, though, is where to set standards, and where not to set standards. He said they are not trying to kill anything. He said it was said earlier they are looking to continue to erode the program, but they are actually not doing that, but trying to do just the opposite. They are trying to improve the program and make it successful, so they can tell the public the program worked, and look how much money is coming back into the community. He said that is really the whole premise here. He said they are not trying to kill it, they are trying to improve it, and they are trying to set some type of standards. He said even students in the 7<sup>th</sup> grade have to follow some type of criteria, some standard, in order to go to the 8<sup>th</sup> grade, and they are not being punished by not going to 8<sup>th</sup> grade, but it is sort of saying they are not ready for the 8<sup>th</sup> grade, and that is what it establishes. He said that is what Council's concern is here. He said they cannot force students to take a college education, they have to prove they are qualified for a college education, so there are standards all along. He said they had a 60 percent washout rate, which he thinks was really huge. He said there were expenses, and it has been said before that costs do not matter, but, in this case, it would normally cost \$1,500 for an average student, to which Dr. Hoy responded, \$3,750 is what it costs for an average student in a year. Mr. Cannon said, what he is getting at is, what it cost this program was probably almost twice what it would normally be per student that succeeded through the program, to which Dr. Hoy responded, not correct. Dr. Hoy said a fulltime student's cost in a year is \$3,750, so this cost the County less than that, because many of the students had partial Pell. Mr. Cannon said, what Dr. Hoy is talking about is a lot different from what they were told at the original Work Session they had about six months ago. He said, from the original Work Session, based on how many students were going through the program, and what the costs were, he did the numbers at the table, and it looked like it was costing the County twice as much. He said, if that is not the case, he would really like to see that. Dr. Hoy said he can figure it out right now. It is \$125 per credit hour times 30 credits. Mr. Cannon said, if there are 25 students who are being paid for to go through the college program, and only 40 percent of those students succeed, he cannot possibly say it is cheaper, because 60 percent of the students were invested in fully, and they have not gone through the program, so it is at least twice as much. Dr. Hoy clarified, the County did not invest fully if they invested half of a semester, perhaps. Mr. Cannon said they can do the numbers later, but if there is a 60 percent washout, it is costing more per student. He said he does not know how it could not be costing more per student. He said, if they are paying for ten students, and only four of those students go through, to him, it appears from face value that they are more than doubling their costs for the taxpayers to send one student through the program. He said however Dr. Hoy would like to rework those numbers and let Council know would be great. He said, getting back to setting standards, Council looked at this washout rate and simply asked what can be done to improve it, to make it more guaranteed that these students coming in will come out of this program, so they thought a 2.5 instead of 2.0. He said, of the programs that Wor-Wic offers, whether it is merit-based scholarships, or need-based scholarships, and he cannot give the exact number on that either, but it is probably 70 to 80 percent of those scholarships that require 2.5 to 3.0 averages, so he does not understand why this program is considered to be on a lesser standard than the multitude of programs. Dr. Hoy said this is not an academic scholarship, to which Mr. Cannon responded, even merit-based scholarships. Dr. Hoy said that is what he is talking about, merit-based scholarships. Mr. Cannon repeated, even merit-based scholarships are 3.0 or 2.5 requirements, so he does not know why this program is supposed to have a different standard. Dr. Hoy responded, this one was not designed that way, and he is sorry if Council thought it was. He said there are opportunities for the best students to get scholarships, at their institution, and elsewhere, and there are opportunities for the lowest economic threshold students to have financial aid. He said the lower middle class and middle class individuals are the ones who are suffering right now trying to pay for college. He said this was intended

to help that group, but also, at the same time, help the County by keeping them here, getting them educated, keeping them here, and helping their workforce. Mr. Cannon said Council understands that, and that is why they bought into this program. He said all they are trying to do is see how they can improve, from their perspective, the percentage of people who will succeed in this program, and the first thought was to follow the same guidelines that have already been established, even in high school. He said they have to judge if that student is qualified enough to go to the next level, and if they are being brought in with a 1.8 or a 2.0, and getting a 60 percent washout rate, maybe they need to improve on the standards in order to make sure they have a student who is more dedicated to a college career, instead of trying to push it on them, or force it on them, but make sure they have proven themselves. He said the other issue is, as far as the \$75,000 is concerned, Council went through that rather carefully to make sure, looking at what the cost of living was, what the poverty levels were, etc. He said the \$75,000 reaches over 60 percent of the population of Wicomico County, and he understands there are Pell grants and everything else that comes into it, to which Dr. Hoy responded, that works up to \$65,000, and a portion of the students up to \$75,000. Mr. Cannon said it is about 300 percent above the federal poverty level, which is the amount they looked at. He said it was not like they just said they would do \$75,000, but they went through quite a bit of structure, as far as different levels of income, and the largest percentage of students they could get into the program, and the \$75,000 was what they settled with. He said he knows back in April, New York announced it was coming up with a program, and he does not like to talk apples and oranges, and he can only give Dr. Hoy his comparisons, but New York has now proposed a program for free college tuition. He said the minimum family requirement is \$100,000, and that is in New York, to which Dr. Hoy responded, growing to \$150,000. Dr. Hoy said Mr. Cannon is thinking of Manhattan. He said there are a lot of economically disadvantaged portions in the whole State of New York, because he goes up and chairs middle states teams to visit those institutions. He said he visits those communities, and everybody in New York is not a millionaire. Mr. Cannon said he still thinks the standards on the Eastern Shore of Maryland may have a different level of average income than New York as a whole. He said they know what the levels are right now. He said this is a County itself that applies for grants from the State, simply for disparity grants, to which Dr. Hoy added, 60 percent of the students in public schools are on free and reduced meals. Dr. Hoy said they are trying to help improve that. Mr. Cannon said the \$75,000 threshold certainly does, because it reaches every single one of them. He said he just wanted to let Dr. Hoy know this was not randomly pulled out of thin air, but it was something they evaluated and came up with a solution.

Mr. Joe Holloway said, in Dr. Hoy's opening statement, he made the comment about staying here. He said Councilman Kilmer brought up that number refers to everybody, and this is not what they are talking about, as far as the grade point, but there is no mechanism to get them to stay here, and that is something he was talking about last week. He said that is something they need to improve on. He said Dr. Hoy made the comment about people moving to Counties to get free tuition. Mr. Joe Holloway said then they could leave. He said, in this program, there is no mechanism to get them to stay here, and they know from the meeting they had that night, the young lady made the comment that she was leaving the area. Dr. Hoy said he is glad Mr. Joe Holloway brought that up, because he would like to talk about her. He said she is very similar to many of their students. He said that student said she was going to leave at the end of that year and transfer. He said she did not leave, she is still here, she is still in the program, she is successful, and now her plan is to transfer to Salisbury. He said, like many students, their goals change. He said that is nice, and he knows she said that to Mr. Joe Holloway, because he was sitting next to her on the other side of Mr. Joe Holloway, and he clutched himself when she said that she was going to move to the Western Shore. He said, but, he subsequently found out that she is here and she is planning on staying here, which is what happens with community college students. Mr. Joe Holloway asked Dr. Hoy if he can agree there is no mechanism to get them to stay here, to which Dr.

Hoy responded, he is absolutely right. Mr. Joe Holloway said the other thing he wants to make clear, for people watching on PAC 14, is that they are only talking about people who are subject to the free tuition, and Council is not pushing for a 2.5 grade average for everybody that goes to Wor-Wic. Dr. Hoy thanked Mr. Joe Holloway for the clarification, as he does not want to lose people because of that. Mr. Joe Holloway said, the other thing is, Mr. Cannon brought up that Council voted for the program. Mr. Joe Holloway clarified, the majority of Council voted for it, not all of Council voted for it. He said he thinks it was a 4 to 3 vote. He said Dr. Hoy brought up that student debt coming out of college is \$36,000 on average. He said the people who are having to pay this out of their taxpayer dollars have a lot of debt too, they have home mortgages, and a lot of people in the County are still struggling. He said the recession took longer to get to Wicomico County, and it is taking longer for Wicomico County to come out. He said, when looking in the Daily Times, there are still a lot of foreclosures, so there is still a lot of problems with folks being in debt. He said he knows it is tough on these guys and girls coming out of college with a \$36,000 loan to have to pay off, but the people they are talking about taxing in order to pay this have debt too. Dr. Hoy said that is a fair point. Mr. Joe Holloway said, the other thing is, he was looking at a letter, and there are Wor-Wic scholarships handed out that have to have a 3.0 and 3.75, to which Dr. Hoy responded, merit scholarships. Mr. Joe Holloway said he is wondering why they have set that standard, when they say it is a merit, to which Dr. Hoy responded, Wor-Wic probably did not. Mr. Joe Holloway said somebody did, to which Dr. Hoy responded, the donor. Mr. Joe Holloway asked why the County should be set to a different standard, to which Dr. Hoy responded, it is a different concept. Mr. Joe Holloway said, the other thing he has to say about all of this, and then he will close, is this was initiated by Wicomico County, and then Somerset ended up being a beneficiary through the State. He said the County is looking at doing workforce scholarships, or tuition loans, or however they work it. He said he thinks the County should ask the State to pick up what the County is doing on their end. Dr. Hoy said there is a Bill in the legislature that was introduced last year to have free community college tuition across the State. He said he does not know if it is going to pass this year, but there are requests that have been put forward for that sort of thing for Maryland. He said New York, Oregon, Tennessee, and another State just passed it this past week. He said they are seeing States step up and do this sort of thing. He said, in Maryland, Prince George's County picked it up this year, and Washington County picked it up through a different process altogether, so it has expanded to Allegany, Garret, Washington County, Prince George's County, Somerset, and Wicomico at this point, so it is going County by County. Mr. Dodd asked if Garret was the original, to which Dr. Hoy responded, Garret was the first in Maryland. He said it has been 11 years in Garret County.

Mr. Dodd then asked Dr. Hoy if he thinks this program would be better off if some of the 2.0 students were on a provisional status taking maybe two classes a semester, to which Dr. Hoy responded, yes. He said he does feel that way, because it is a big challenge for some of those students, and that might be a way to do it. He said Brian comes to him all the time and asks if there is a possibility they could have fewer credit hours in the program, and that is something that could be looked at.

Mr. Matt Holloway said he just has three points. He said, in his mind, if they want to increase the number of successful students in the program, they need to accept more students into the program. He said he thinks the way to do that is increasing the income limit, which he talked about to Mr. Cannon on the phone. He said they have to keep in mind that the goal here is not to get the best percentage of completion of this program, but the goal is economic development, and that is the entire goal of this program. He said whether somebody only completes one year of it, and then goes out into the workforce, or goes in a different direction, hopefully that is adding to the economic development of the area. He said, lastly, they have one data point so far, and he is a hunter, and he would not adjust his scope on his rifle if he had only shot one shot. He said they all shoot three shots before they make any

adjustments. He said he thinks it is way too early to make adjustments to the GPA in order to try to change the outcome of this.

Mr. Ernie Davis said, Dr. Hoy made a statement which he kind of agrees with. He said, in high school, students only need a 2.0 to go to the next grade. Dr. Hoy said, actually, through this program, he learned something he did not know, and that is students can graduate from high school with less than a 2.0, and they can move forward with social promotion with less than a 2.0. He said that was news to him, but, again, he does not work in the public schools. Mr. Davis said, when looking at that, as well as the person who could be a late bloomer and could go to college and get a 3.0, just because that student only slid by in school, this 2.5 would restrict that student from going to college. He asked, in reference to \$65,000 income for Pell Grant, does that Pell Grant cover their whole tuition, to which Dr. Hoy responded, for most of the families at \$65,000 it does. He said Pell today covers about 50 percent of college costs. He said 20 years ago it covered 92 percent of college costs. He said Pell reduction for community college students has been significant, because Pell is supposed to pick up living expenses, and other types of things. He said it picks up living expenses for people who go to four year institutions, their dormitory, and that sort of thing. He said community college students are commuters. He said they have living expenses, and it should deal with some of that, but, by today's standards, Pell covers about 50 percent of their costs, because there are obviously other costs associated with college attendance. He said it is not 100 percent of everything for anybody. He said it covers 100 percent tuition and fees for most families with an adjusted family income of \$65,000 or less. Mr. Davis said he is in agreement with Councilman Matt Holloway. He asked, for a student to get 100 percent of this scholarship, does the student's family income have to be between \$65,000 and \$75,000, to which Dr. Hoy responded, closer to the \$75,000, because some of the people between \$65,000 and \$75,000 are getting partial Pell. Mr. Davis said they are limiting the number of kids who can apply for 100 percent of this scholarship, and if they want to increase the GPA to 2.5, they will shrink that more, because those people who are in between those income levels are not all at a 2.5, so they are going to decrease the number. He said he is in agreement that they need to increase the number of kids, and, the way the program is now, they have to increase that threshold. He said, if not, they will decrease the number of kids who will enroll with a 2.5, because all the kids need to graduate high school is a 2.0, and the kids know that. He said, like it was said, the student may be a late bloomer, but they cannot get in because they do not have a 2.5. Dr. Hoy responded, he is absolutely right. He said only eight people would have qualified this year if the 2.5 threshold were in there. He repeated, it would have only been eight people who were eligible for any dollars for the Wicomico Impact Scholarship. Mr. Cannon said, but, they might have had all eight pass, to which Dr. Hoy responded, not necessarily. Mr. Joe Holloway asked, of these eight, were they the ones who completed the program, to which Dr. Hoy responded, that is this year's class, and he does not have last year's numbers in his head. He said, of last year's group who they retained, only one student has less than a 2.5 college GPA, and it is 2.47. He said the students are doing well, and, in fact, they have an average GPA that is higher than the student body at large. He further said, but, not everybody is able to stay in the program, because, in some cases, life gets in the way, and in other cases that life experience is that they need to go part-time and work full-time. He said, in some cases they are transferring. Mr. Joe Holloway said that is one of his hang-ups about this, and he understands that things happen, life changes. He said, but, the County is paying for it. It is being paid for with taxpayers' dollars, and there are no ramifications if they just drop out, and this money has been spent. Dr. Hoy responded, he does not have the number in his head, but he thinks almost all of the students earned college credits in the fall. He said they completed the course work, they just did not continue in the program. He asked not to be held to that statement, because he does not have the information in front of him. Mr. Joe Holloway said the goal is for them to continue and graduate, to which Dr. Hoy responded, sure, we want them all to come through and graduate, but the most economically

challenged students are the most academically challenged students. He said that is just a reality, a statistical reality, so it takes a little more to help those students be successful. Mr. Kilmer said, but they are talking about people between an income of \$65,000 and \$75,000, which is above the median income in Wicomico County, to which Dr. Hoy responded, that is still considered low income. Mr. Kilmer asked, low income is \$65,000, to which Dr. Hoy responded, in many families of four or larger, yes, they get into that situation where they still have significant issues trying to make the daily expenses met. Mr. Joe Holloway said that is life choices, to which Dr. Hoy responded, sometimes it is life choices. Mr. Kilmer said, again, with larger families he understands what Dr. Hoy is saying, where there can be some who make \$65,000, but, on the whole, if they are above the median income in Wicomico County, it is hard to say that those people are low income, on the whole, and there are exceptions, as always. He said, just to clarify, a little bit to Ms. Ashanti's point, most low income people qualify for Pell grants, so this would not affect qualifications for Pell grants, and he does not think there are any academic qualifications for Pell grants. He said people who are low income and come from struggling families would still have Pell grants, and could still go to Wor-Wic and have 100 percent of their tuition and fees covered, regardless of anything Council does, or even if this program went away, which it is not going to. Dr. Hoy said he agrees, but, and Council has heard him say this several times, he thinks the fact that they can tell students that they can come to school and get a free college education brings some students who would not have otherwise thought about college. He said, then when they come, they find out Pell covered it, it was not the County, but it was the Pell, but it was because of the program that they came, and then they found out they had it paid for. Mr. Kilmer said he does not disagree with Dr. Hoy on that, and there is a symbolic nature of it, but, again, this program is not going away, so there will always be that. He said, but, in terms of students who are 2.0 or 1.8 from low income, they can still go to Wor-Wic, and Pell grants will still pay 100 percent of their tuition, to which Dr. Hoy added, as long as they are successful, and for a period of time. Mr. Kilmer said they are not talking about low income here with this program, but they are talking about middle income, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they are talking about middle income. Mr. Kilmer said they then should not be talking about how people from low income struggle in this program, they are talking about middle income folks. He said, again, Wor-Wic is about \$3,700, which is the figure he got from the Community College Foundation of America, to which Dr. Hoy responded, \$3,750. Mr. Kilmer asked, a household with \$95,000 is going to struggle with \$3,750 and cannot afford that, to which Dr. Hoy responded, no, they are not. He clarified, they are trying to get them to come and be successful, they are trying to get them to come and stay in their community, they are trying to get them to come and graduate from college without a lot of college debt, because they can transfer on to a four-year institution, and come back, and be a school teacher. Mr. Kilmer asked if Dr. Hoy does not think those students would have come to Wor-Wic anyway? He said, again, \$3,750 if the family is making \$100,000, or \$110,000, is not going to be much debt, if any debt, for a family like that. Dr. Hoy said he was surprised by the numbers with the experience they had with Somerset County, because over 70 percent of the school-aged population are on free and reduced meals, and they had a significant number of people, over 50 percent, who did not qualify for Pell. Mr. Kilmer said, but that does not mean they would not have come to Wor-Wic anyway, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they had a 57 percent increase in first time full-time students, so, yes, it does tell him that. Mr. Kilmer said they could have gone somewhere else, they could have gone to UMES, or they could have gone to SU. He said just because they are enrolled in the program does not necessarily mean they would not have gone to college anyway. He said they can be paying for people who would have gone otherwise, they could be paying for people who would have gone elsewhere, so Dr. Hoy cannot say these people are attracted solely because of that program, that they are new college students, they are college students who came out of the woodwork, where they are paying for people who otherwise would not have been eligible. Dr. Hoy responded, he thinks the coming out of the woodwork affect is what happens to those students who are told they can go to college for free, and then they find out somebody else is going to pay for it,

and not Wicomico County. Mr. Kilmer said, again, he thinks they need to look for ways to focus on the students who need it, not just trying to boost success numbers by letting people in who otherwise would have paid for college themselves, or gone to SU, but who would not have persisted through Wor-Wic. He said he really thinks they have an opportunity to focus on that.

Mr. Cannon asked Dr. Hoy what his timeline is if anything changes. He said he knows the last time there was a real problem where they passed it late, and it made it hard for Dr. Hoy to promote it soon enough. Dr. Hoy said students are already applying, and they will continue to throughout the spring. He said June 1, 2018 is the absolute deadline. Mr. Cannon said it seems like there is a little bit of time here that, if anything changes, it gives the high school students plenty of time. Dr. Hoy said hopefully Council will not make changes to students who are already in the program, to which Mr. Cannon responded, the only thing this is representing right now are those who are looking to come into the program. He clarified, it is not impacting those who are already in it. He said he is just trying to figure out what the timeline is, because he was concerned about that, and he does not want to have the same problem they had the last time. He asked Dr. Hoy when he thinks he will have some type of tracking data, to which Dr. Hoy responded, five years. Mr. Cannon said he does not need a full blown report of whether the student graduated, and if they are now working in Wicomico County. He said he is just talking about the success of the students in the program, and what each of those individual students are doing on a semester basis, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they are preparing a report for Council every September, an annual report, but, really, it is going to be very difficult to judge. He said maybe three years, but he would say, when looking at three years, five years, and actually it should be six. He said they get three years to get their degree, then they give three years of cohorts to find out where they are and see if it grows, and see if they improved during that period of time. He said he told Council originally he thought ten years was really the time, and it has to be a longitudinal study to really figure it out, to which Mr. Cannon responded, to see what the economic development benefit is that comes about. Dr. Hoy said that would be even longer. Mr. Cannon said he is just looking for something that says, here is what happened to these ten students last semester. He said he is looking for something really simple. Dr. Hoy said each September they will come to Council with the outline of the numbers they had this past year, here is what happened to the students, and here they are, and that is what Brian brought to Council in September. He said that is what is in the document that Council approved. Mr. Cannon said he felt it lacked a little bit of solid tracking. He said it was more of a general document saying some of them did this, and some of them did that, and he was looking for more specific numbers saying, this many people were brought into the program, and here is what happened to each and every one, because these students can be tracked, and that is what he was looking for. Dr. Hoy said he re-read it before he came in tonight, and he thought the data was there, but if Council needs more, they certainly want to provide Council with that. Mr. Cannon said he will take whatever they have, to which Dr. Hoy responded, other than discrete information about individual students that personally identifies them specifically. Mr. Cannon said they are just trying to get specifically what the success rate was, if they did not get through the program because there was a family issue, if they did not get through the program because of their grades, whatever those circumstances might have been, and Dr. Hoy can give Council all of that information without divulging who the individual children are. He said he thinks that is all they are looking for, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they can do that.

Mr. Joe Holloway said he has one more question. He said, needless to say, Wor-Wic is not an enterprise account, and taxpayer dollars fund Wor-Wic from Worcester, Wicomico, Somerset, State, and some Federal. He said the more students, whether full-time enrollment or part-time enrollment, basically, the budget has to be increased to take care of that, because they do not pay the exact cost of what their education is, correct? Dr. Hoy said the State design is a third, a third, a third. He said they are not there

because the students are paying a bigger share. Mr. Joe Holloway clarified, the more they increase enrollment, full-time or part-time, basically, the more the State or the Counties have to put in, to which Dr. Hoy added, or should. Dr. Hoy said he agrees.

Mr. Cannon said he appreciates Dr. Hoy taking his time, to which Dr. Hoy responded, he does thank Council for their interest in the program, he thanks them for their support, and it is important they have these conversations so he knows where Council is coming from, but also so Council understands where he is coming from as it relates to this, because he thinks this can benefit their community, and that is the only reason they brought it forward. He said Executive Culver came to him and asked what they could do, and said here is an idea, we should try to work it. Dr. Hoy said this came up because he had shared what Garret County has been doing for the last ten or eleven years, and they find it to be very successful. Mr. Cannon said, honestly, even though they may disagree, all they are trying to do is improve on it, to which Dr. Hoy responded, they are not disagreeable. Mr. Cannon said they are trying to see it be more successful. There was no further discussion.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
John T. Cannon, President

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Larry W. Dodd, Vice President, District 3

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Ernest F. Davis, District 1

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Marc Kilmer, District 2

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
John B. Hall, District 4

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Joe Holloway, District 5

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Matt Holloway, At-Large

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Laura Hurley, Council Administrator